OLIVER ARCHITECTURE

BRECON CATHEDRAL: OPTIONS APPRAISAL MATRIX FOR IMPROVED ACCESS INTO CATHEDRAL

MAY 2022, version v.3

Note: This document has been prepared following the public consultation event on 9th April 2022. A number of options were discussed during the event and several more raised informally afterwards. The purpose of the document is to establish a way of appraising the merits of the various options. For each option, a series of comments on appropriate topics are noted, with a summary of LOW, MEDIUM or HIGH. A LOW summary may of course mean a poor outcome, a low financial cost option or a low impact on heritage, so it may be good or bad. All entrances to the Cathedral are considered, starting at the North Transept and working anti-clockwise to the South Aisle. Part M of the Building Regulations defines the lengths and pitch of a ramp. Revised following input from Jane Toplis Associates Ltd, access consultant.

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from North	Universal Access from South	Access to WCs	Impact on Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
1	North Transept Door (Peter Jenkins and Dannatt Johnson 'Option 2).	From the car park and lych gate, use the existing path (resurfaced to avoid uneven surfaces) to the North Porch, with a new path to the North Transept, gently pitched to the slightly raised threshold. New ramp within North Transept down to floor level.	Provides access for wheelchair users, but able bodied users would continue to use existing doors, so wheelchair users are separated and use a lesser door. Score = LOW	No improvement. Score = LOW	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Minimal impact. Score = LOW	Very poor, as delivers wheelchair users too far east inside the Cathedral. Score = LOW	Landscaping but otherwise relatively modest. Score = LOW	None noted.
2	North Porch lowered pathway (Peter Jenkins and Dannatt Johnson 'Option 1')	From the Lych Gate, excavate to lower the pathway so that it gradually arrives at internal floor level outside the North Porch (less steep than a ramp). Lower the floor in the North Porch. Alter the doorways to suit.	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route, but it is a long way from the car oark. Score = MEDIUM	No improvement. Score = LOW	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Major impact on both the North Porch, its historic joinery, and archaeology within the churchyard. Score = HIGH	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. However, there will be difficulties in underpinning the Porch and diverting rainwater from running into the building. Score = LOW	Major cost for underpinning and archaeology. Score = HIGH	Potential for new glazed joinery to encourage visitors.

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from North	Universal Access from South	Access to WCs	Impact on Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
3	North Porch raised floor and ramp	During the event, a suggestion was made to raise the floor level within the Porch to that of the external ground level and then create a ramp within the Nave or North Aisle. This would be a 10m long ramp (the maximum permitted), with a landing and then a further 1.8m ramp. It would reach to the South Aisle. This is why options to explore ramps within the Porch itself were explored.	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route, although ramps are less suitable for some users, but it is a long way from the car park and the length of ramps is excessive. There is no alternative stepped route. Score = MEDIUM	No improvement. Score = LOW	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Major impact on the appearance of the interior of the Cathedral and the Porch. Score = HIGH	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. However, the extent of the ramp will reduce the functionality of the interior. Score = LOW	Alterations to Porch joinery and floor, new ramps. Score = HIGH	Potential for new glazed joinery to encourage visitors.
4	North Porch internal ramp	A short ramp up to the North Porch threshold, then a ramp down inside the Porch. A further short ramp inside the North Aisle.	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route, although ramps are less suitable for some users. Level landings will be required. There is no alternative stepped route. Score = LOW	No improvement. Score = LOW	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Impact on the interior of the North Porch and lesser impact on interior of North Aisle. Alterations needed to C19 inner doors.	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. Little impact on functionality at west end.	Alterations to Porch joinery and floor, new ramps. Score = MEDIUM	Potential for new glazed joinery to encourage visitors.

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from North	Universal Access from	Access to WCs	Impact on	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
				South		Heritage			
						Score = MEDIUM	Score =		
							MEDIUM		
	To and the second secon								
5	North Porch internal	Removal of the North	Both wheelchair users and	No improvement.	Improvements from South	Impact on the	Arrival at the	Alterations to	Potential for new
	ramp with lowered	Porch outer door threshold,	able bodied users will be able	Score = LOW	Door down to Accessible	interior of the	west end of the	Porch joinery	glazed joinery to
	threshold	then ramping the floor of	to use this route, although	Score EGV	WC will be needed, as	North Porch and	church is	and floor,	encourage
		the North Porch. A further	ramps are less suitable for		proposed for many	lesser impact on	suitable. Little	new ramps.	visitors.
		short ramp within the	some users. Level landings		options.	interior of North	impact on	Score =	
		North Aisle.	will be required. There is no		Score = MEDIUM	Aisle. Alterations	functionality at	MEDIUM	
		1101011110101	alternative stepped route.		00010 1/122101/1	needed to	west end.	1,122101,1	
			Score = LOW			medieval outer	External		
						doors.	rainwater will		
						Score = MEDIUM	need to be		
			P				diverted.		
							Score = HIGH		
			52						
6	North Porch handrail	During the event, it was	Improvement for less able	No improvement.	Improvements will need to	Minor impact	Arrival at the	Relatively	This option
	NB: A short term	noted that the existing	bodied but not for wheelchair		be in a later phase.	only.	west end of the	low cost.	achieves a short-
	improvement, which does	arrangement is unsafe. The	users.				church is		term benefit only.
	not intend to resolve the	provision of a central					suitable.		However, it could
	question of wheelchair	handrail in the North Porch					Funerals will		protect from
	access.	and into the North Aisle					have to carry		litigation.

Ι	Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from North	Universal Access from South	Access to WCs	Impact on Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
			would assist less able bodied visitors. Lighting should be made brighter. Steps should be better marked.		South		Ticittage	coffins above the handrail.		
7	7	New West Door	Alterations to the area west of the Nave to create a shallow pitched access to a new doorway with draught lobby inside.	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route, which is equidistant between the north and south approaches. Score = HIGH	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route. Score = HIGH	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Loss of C14th masonry between buttresses, but this is accepted in principle by both Cadw and local authority. Score = HIGH	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. Comments were made during the event about loss of raked seating during performances but this impact is minimal and would be offset by improvements to seating and staging at the Crossing. Score = HIGH	External landscaping, forming new opening, relocating memorials and draught lobby. The only option which has been costed by the QS includes other items such as chair store. Score = MEDIUM	Axial approach makes this entrance easier to find for new visitors. Creation of external space. Connections with the Tithe Barn.
88	3	Boiler House (Paul Woods's suggestion)	Rebuild the Boiler House to form entrance to the	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be	North Aisle Font moved east Font Nave Font Move staff South Aisle Improvements from South Door down to Accessible	Loss of 1940 boiler house has	Arrival at the west end of the	Construction of a new	Opportunity to address the
		(1 uui vvoous 5 suggestion)	Cathedral, relocating heating system elsewhere.	to use this route, which is only slightly closer to those	able to use this route, which is only slightly closer to	WC will be needed, as	no negative impact. Loss of	church is suitable. Loss	entrance, external	question of heating in relation

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from North	Universal Access from South	Access to WCs	Impact on Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
		Regrade external levels to provide universal access. Form a new opening under the South Aisle west window.	approaching from the north. A new ramp or platform lift would be needed inside the new build. Score = LOW	those approaching from the north. A new ramp or platform lift would be needed inside the new build. Score = LOW	proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	C14th South Aisle masonry below window. Score = HIGH	of childrens' corner (west end of South Aisle) has vetoed this option in the past. Score = MEDIUM	landscaping and heating alterations makes this a very expensive option. Score =HIGH	to carbon which will need to be addressed soon. Opportunity to design a welcoming entrance.
9	South Door Ramp	A 1 in 9.5 ramp from outside the South Aisle south door towards the Vestry west door. NB: This is too steep and so is noncompliant.	1 -	ot compliant with Building gulations. Score = NIL	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Negligible impact. Score = LOW	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. However, the conflict of wheelchair users, visitors and processions at the South Door is significant. Score = LOW	Very modest. Score = LOW	None noted.
10	South Door Ramps	A 1 in 12 ramp from outside the South Aisle south door towards the Vestry west door. The door threshold would need to be raised as the ramp needs to extend externally also.	and able bodied users will be able to use this route, which is only slightly closer to those approaching from the north. There is no space Bo the bo this the 15	th wheelchair users and able th wheelchair users and able died users will be able to use is route, which is only slightly oser to those approaching from a north. There is no space for a 00mm landing clear of the or swing.	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Negligible impact. Score = LOW	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. However, the conflict of wheelchair users, visitors	Very modest. Score = LOW	None noted.

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from No	orth	Universal Access from South	Access to WCs	Impact on Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
			for a 1500mm landing clear of the door swing. Score = LOW	Score =			Tientage	and processions at the South Door is significant. Score = LOW		
11	South Door enlarged opening	During the event, it was suggested that the conflicts between visitors and clergy/choir processions at the South Aisle south door could be mitigated by widening the door. This option would need to be combined with others to be effective.	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route, which is only slightly closer to those approaching from the north. Score = MEDIUM	bodied this rou	wheelchair users and able I users will be able to use ute, albeit not side-by-side. MEDIUM	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	This is a 'modern' C19th door but adjacent masonry is C14th. Loss of fabric would occur. Score = MEDIUM	A wider door would not address the conflict between visitors, processions and those using the WCs. Score = LOW	Additional cost to Option 15 (already scored at HIGH).	Improved connection to Vestry Wing.
12	South Door handrails NB: A short term improvement, which does not intend to resolve the question of wheelchair access.	During the event, it was noted that the existing arrangement is unsafe. Lighting is good but there is no handrail to assist those climbing the two steps.	No improvement.	1 *	vement for less able I but not for wheelchair	Improvements will need to be in a later phase.	Minor impact only.	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable.	Relatively low cost.	This option achieves a short- term benefit only. However, it could protect from litigation.
13	Bishop's Door (Poppy's suggestion)	External ramp to the threshold of the Bishop's Door (Vestry Wing south end).	Both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use this route, which is only slightly closer to those approaching from the north. However it is not an inclusive entrance as most users will use other doors and is a low status doorway into a WC lobby. Score = LOW	bodied this rou Howev entrance other d	wheelchair users and able I users will be able to use ute, albeit not side-by-side. Wer it is not an inclusive ce as most users will use doors and is a low status ay into a WC lobby. = LOW	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Minor impact only. Score = LOW	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable. However, the conflict of wheelchair users, visitors and processions at the South Door is significant. Score = LOW	Very modest. Score = LOW	None noted.

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from No	orth Universal Access from	Access to WCs	Impact on	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
Kei.	Name	Description	Chiversal Access from No	South	Access to Wes	Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other beliefits
14	Vestry Wing Foyer	Erection of a new building	Both wheelchair users	Both wheelchair users and able	Improvements from South	Impact of new	Arrival at the	Erection of a	Opportunity to
	(Poppy's suggestion)	against the west elevation	and able bodied users will be able to use this	bodied users will be able to use this route.	Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as	structure against	west end of the church is	new building makes this a	improve welcome for visitors
	Vestry West Door version	of the Vestry wing to contain ramped access,	route, which is only	Score = HIGH	proposed for many	grade I Vestry elevation will be	suitable.	very	through new
	Version	assumed to arrive at the	slightly closer to those	Score Therr	options.	high. In addition,	However, the	expensive	build.
		Vestry west door, which	approaching from the		Score = MEDIUM	raising historic	conflict of	option.	
		would be raised to the level	north.			door. Score =	wheelchair	Score =HIGH	
		of the internal floor of the	Score = MEDIUM			HIGH	users, visitors		
15	Voctry Wing Fover	Cathedral.	Both wheelchair users	Both wheelchair users and able	Improvements from South	Impact of nav	and processions at the South Door is significant. Score = LOW	Erection of a	Opportunity to
15	Vestry Wing Foyer (Poppy's suggestion)	Erection of a new building against the west elevation	and able bodied users	both wheelchair users and able bodied users will be able to use	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible	Impact of new structure against	west end of the	new building	Opportunity to improve welcome
	Bishop's Door version	of the Vestry wing to	will be able to use this	this route. However it is not an	WC will be needed, as	grade I Vestry	church is	makes this a	for visitors
		contain ramped access,	route, which is only	inclusive entrance as most users	proposed for many	elevation will be	suitable, albeit	very	through new
		assumed to arrive at the	slightly closer to those	will use other doors and is a low	options.	high. Score =	compromised	expensive	build.
		Bishop's door.	approaching from the	status doorway.	Score = MEDIUM	HIGH	by taking all	option.	
			north. However it is not	Score = LOW			visitors	Score =HIGH	
			an inclusive entrance as				through a		
			most users will use other				corridor.		
			doors and is a low status				However, the		
			doorway.				conflict of		
			Score = LOW				wheelchair		

Ref.	Name	Description	Universal Access from North	Universal Access from South	Access to WCs	Impact on Heritage	Functionality	Cost	Other Benefits
							users, visitors and processions at the South Door is significant. Score = LOW		
16	Vestry Wing East Door	Resurfaced path to angle between Vestry and South Aisle, ramped up to new raised threshold at Cathedral floor level.	No improvement. Score = LOW	Provides access for wheelchair users, but able bodied users would continue to use existing doors, so wheelchair users are separated and use a lesser door. Score = LOW	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options. Score = MEDIUM	Impact raising height of existing arch headed doorway. Score = MEDIUM	Arrival at the west end of the church is suitable, albeit compromised by taking all visitors through a corridor. However, the conflict of wheelchair users, visitors and processions at the South Door is significant. Score = LOW	Not insignificant due to length of path and alterations to door. Score = MEDIUM	None noted.
17	South Aisle South East Door	Resurfaced path to South Aisle south east door, ramped up to threshold.	No improvement. Score = LOW	Provides access for wheelchair users, but able bodied users would continue to use existing doors, so wheelchair users	Improvements from South Door down to Accessible WC will be needed, as proposed for many options.	Very minor. Score = LOW	Very poor, as delivers wheelchair users too far	Not insignificant due to length of path.	None noted.

